

	Report Title	Station Arts Building Order Compliance
	Report No.	RCP 19-11
	Author	Rick Cox, Director of Recreation, Culture & Parks
	Meeting Type	Council Meeting
	Council Date	February 11, 2019
	Attachments	Feb 3 Letter from TDCG Updated Compliance Options Cost Estimates

RECOMMENDATION

THAT Council receives Report RCP 19-11 – Station Arts Building Compliance;

AND THAT Council gives pre-budget approval for up to \$20,000 from reserves for staff to proceed with assembling the necessary design work to apply for a building permit by April 1, 2019;

AND THAT Council approves Option 2 - With Sprinklers to meet the requirements of Unsafe Building Order UBO 10-15-2018.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

At the Council Budget Meeting on January 29, staff was directed to report back by February 11 on:

- the costs of meeting the code requirements at the Station Arts Building;
- what is required to continue occupancy for that building after April 1, 2019;
- the costs to relocate the programs; and
- the time that this building would need to be closed in order to complete the required work.

This report provides as much of that information as is currently available. It also requests pre-budget approval to proceed with the design work to achieve compliance, and to select the preferred option for achieving that compliance.

BACKGROUND

In October 2018, a+LiNK Architects Inc. conducted a Facility Condition Analysis at the 41 Bridge Street location which identified building code compliance concerns. As a result the Town's Chief Building Official issued an Unsafe Building Order and required that no public use of the basement took place.

There are two main components to the non-compliance status identified in the report:

1. **Containment;** the floor assembly over the basement is not appropriately fire separated as required by OBC part 3.2.1.4. This separation is to have a ¾ hour fire resistance rating and appropriate rated closers on door openings.
2. **Evacuation;** There are no code compliant exits from the basement. The existing basement access to exit stair wells are not fire separated and exit into the ground floor occupied spaces. This is not permitted in accordance with OBC part 3.4. The stairs from

the basement also have a number of deficiencies including uneven riser heights, low headroom, and missing handrail extensions that are not in compliance with code requirements.

Station Arts Centre Building Condition Assessment Report - a+LiNK Architects Inc. – November 2018

Estimated Cost to Meet Compliance

The cost to prepare a design solution and building specifications for any of the three options is the same. In the report, a+LiNK identifies three potential approaches to achieve compliance:

Option 1: W/O Sprinklers - cost estimate \$181,800

- install the required fire separation on the existing basement structure
- build a code-compliant stairwell exiting directly outside the building
- rebuild existing communication stairs to be compliant including fire rated doors at the top and bottom and reconfigure lobby
- recommended to decommission west stairwell.

The Consultants do not recommend this option: *“While this option is possible, the cost implications and intrusions on the facility are perceived to be too great to recommend and requires the communication stairs to have fire rated doors.”* This option would return the building usage to pre-order status.

Option 2: With Sprinklers - cost estimate \$170,136

- install a sprinkler system in the building
- build a code-compliant stairwell exiting directly outside the building
- recommended to decommission west stairwell.

The Consultants recommend this option: *“This option utilizes Part 11 of the OBC to have sprinklering in lieu of fire separations. This is more cost effective than upgrading the fire ratings and adding fire dampers and doors. With sprinklering, only one exit is required from the basement. Also the communication stairs are permitted as part of an interconnected floor space that is sprinklered.”* This option would return the building usage to pre-order status.

Option 3: Reduce area - cost estimate \$170,568*

- permanently reduce basement floor area to less than 150m³
- install the required fire separation on the resulting basement structure
- build a code-compliant stairwell exiting directly outside the building
- rebuild existing communication stairs to be compliant including fire rated doors at the top and bottom and reconfigure lobby
- decommission west stairwell.

The Consultants found this option to not be feasible: *“This option investigated the possibility of reducing the occupied area of the basement to eliminate the requirement for a second exit from the basement... Option 2 does not require this reduction as sprinklering increases that allowable area for 1 exit. All the requirements listed for option 1 would be required for this option as well. This option was deemed to be infeasible.”*

* It should be noted that this cost estimate **has been updated** to include an allowance for the cost of reducing the floor space. Costing for this element is considerable as this space must be permanently and completely removed; essentially it will need to be walled off and filled in.

This option has been selected as the preferred option by the Tillsonburg District Craft Guild on the assumption that a building expansion to create a ground-level classroom would be built in

the near future to offset the lost floor space in the basement. While the Guild is prepared to assist with the fundraising to fund this new space, their position is that the building would be a Town asset and therefore be the Town's responsibility to put in place. The President noted in her presentation to Council on January 28, 2019 that *"As a Municipal building, we feel the addition becomes part of the structure & therefore Town owned. We are, however, willing to: possibly invest, search out grant opportunities & speak with businesses & Station supporters to enable moving the project forward in the most efficient way possible."*

With the updated cost estimate narrowing the cost differential to basically zero, it does not make sense to spend the same amount of money for a smaller facility as it would cost to maintain the existing facility.

While an expansion that creates a barrier-free, modern classroom space is a long-term aspiration, it does not seem feasible in the short term given the Town's other capital infrastructure needs. There are buried sanitary and natural gas utilities located in the area between the Station Arts building and the adjacent church property which compromise the potential of using this space for an expansion.

The Cost to Relocate Programs

The Craft Guild has not provided an estimate for this cost as they do not want to go down this route. The reasons for this include the logistics of moving staff, equipment and supplies back and forth between the Station and the alternative location, as well as the workload of staffing and supervising two locations. Finally, the impact to the profile of the Station Arts Centre not being at the Station detracts from their hard work to establish their brand.

The Town does not have adequate alternative space to provide for the summer programming needs of the Guild in addition to the Town's programs. It may be possible to accommodate some of the classes and workshops at Town-owned facilities, depending on the nature of the class.

The President of the Guild has provided an outline of the potential impact on revenue in the attached letter from the President. They acknowledge that a smaller basement area would result in a negative revenue impact from smaller class sizes.

The Time the Building Would Be Closed.

Without clear direction on the preferred compliance option, it is difficult to estimate the construction window and impact on building operations. If decisions are made quickly there is a chance that the required construction could take place during the months of May and June in order to meet compliance by July 1. The President has indicated in her letter that the least-worst window for their operations would be for compliance to be achieved by July 1. If that is not possible, the Guild has requested that construction not begin until fall. This approach will not meet with the Unsafe Building Order.

Potential ideal timeline:

- February 11 – approval to proceed with design for preferred option
- April 1 – permit application submission and procurement begins
- May 1 through June 15 - Construction

Requirements to Maintain Occupancy After April 1, 2019

As per Unsafe Building Order UBO 10-15-2018, in order to be compliant with the Order, the Town must “Make application, obtain a building permit to repair the unsafe condition as per the architect/consultant’s report and proceed in completing the work in a timely manner.”

To that end, design work and construction planning must commence well in advance of April 1 in order to have the required drawings and specifications in time to submit the building permit application on or before that date. As a result, staff is asking for pre-budget approval to spend up to \$25,000 on architectural services to prepare this material.

Staff Recommendation:

Staff agree with the consultants that the most feasible and cost-effective choice for the Town in the long term is Option 2 – With Sprinklers. This option achieves compliance and also protects the whole building and contents with sprinklers in case of fire. It does not compromise the existing floor space or the potential for future expansion.

Alternative Recommendation: Council could decide to proceed with Option 3 – Reduce Floor Area. Discussion with both the architects and with the Craft Guild would need to take place to determine the layout which would achieve the floor space reduction while minimizing disruption to the usability of the space. The resolution would need to be amended to reflect this change.

FINANCIAL IMPACT/FUNDING SOURCE

The 2019 draft budget includes \$400,000 for work at the 41 Bridge Street location, including \$80,000 for scheduled roof repairs and \$320,000 for work identified as high priority in the Facility Condition Analysis report including the building code compliance items. Currently the funding sources for this allocation are identified as \$40,000 from taxation and \$360,000 from reserves.

During the budget discussions scheduled for February 19, Council can decide whether to proceed with all three components of the project (1. compliance, 2. roofing, & 3. other repairs) in 2019, or to defer the roofing and or other repairs to a future budget year.

Pre-budget approval for the design work is needed so it can begin as soon as possible. It will be impossible to meet the April 1 compliance deadline without obtaining this approval on February 11, 2019.

COMMUNITY STRATEGIC PLAN (CSP) IMPACT

1. Excellence in Local Government
 - ☐ Demonstrate strong leadership in Town initiatives
 - ☐ Streamline communication and effectively collaborate within local government
 - ☒ Demonstrate accountability
2. Economic Sustainability
 - ☐ Support new and existing businesses and provide a variety of employment opportunities
 - ☐ Provide diverse retail services in the downtown core
 - ☐ Provide appropriate education and training opportunities in line with Tillsonburg’s economy

3. Demographic Balance

- ☒ Make Tillsonburg an attractive place to live for youth and young professionals
- ☐ Provide opportunities for families to thrive
- ☒ Support the aging population and an active senior citizenship

4. Culture and Community

- ☐ Promote Tillsonburg as a unique and welcoming community
- ☒ Provide a variety of leisure and cultural opportunities to suit all interests
- ☐ Improve mobility and promote environmentally sustainable living

Report Approval Details

Document Title:	RCP 19-11 - Station Arts Building Order Compliance.docx
Attachments:	- RCP 19-11 - ATT 01 - Building Compliance project option to Town Feb 2019.pdf - RCP 19-11 - ATT 02 - Updated Compliance Option Cost Estimates.pdf
Final Approval Date:	Feb 6, 2019

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:



David Calder - Feb 6, 2019 - 3:17 PM